

# Extremal theory of hypergraphs; Density of hypergraphs avoiding the Fano plane

Zdeněk Dvořák

November 20, 2020

A  $k$ -uniform hypergraph  $G$  is a pair  $(V, E)$ , where  $E$  is a set of  $k$ -element subsets of  $V$ , called hyperedges. Notation:  $|G|$  number of vertices of  $G$ ,  $\|G\|$  number of hyperedges of  $G$ . Similarly to the graph case (see Lesson 1), we have

**Definition 1.** Let  $F_1, \dots, F_m$  be  $k$ -uniform hypergraphs. Maximum number of edges of a  $k$ -uniform hypergraph with  $n$  vertices that does not contain any subhypergraph isomorphic to  $F_1, \dots, F_m$ :

$$\text{ex}(n; F_1, \dots, F_m).$$

*Density version:*

$$\overline{\text{ex}}(n; F_1, \dots, F_m) = \frac{\text{ex}(n; F_1, \dots, F_m)}{\binom{n}{k}}.$$

*Asymptotic density:*

$$\overline{\text{ex}}(\infty; F_1, \dots, F_m) = \inf\{\overline{\text{ex}}(n; F_1, \dots, F_m) : n \in \mathbb{N}\}.$$

**Lemma 2.** If  $n_1 \geq n_2$ , then  $\overline{\text{ex}}(n_1; F_1, \dots, F_m) \leq \overline{\text{ex}}(n_2; F_1, \dots, F_m)$ .

**Corollary 3.**

$$\overline{\text{ex}}(\infty; F_1, \dots, F_m) = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \overline{\text{ex}}(n; F_1, \dots, F_m),$$

and for every  $n_0$  we have

$$\overline{\text{ex}}(\infty; F_1, \dots, F_m) \leq \overline{\text{ex}}(n_0; F_1, \dots, F_m).$$

Asymptotically, for  $n \rightarrow \infty$ , we have

$$\text{ex}(n; F_1, \dots, F_m) = (\overline{\text{ex}}(\infty; F_1, \dots, F_m) + o(1)) \frac{n^k}{k}.$$

In general, the extremal theory for hypergraphs is much more challenging than for graphs. For example, we do not even know  $\overline{\text{ex}}(\infty; K_4^{(3)})$  for the complete 3-uniform hypergraph  $K_4^{(3)}$  with four vertices. We will need the following simple (non-tight bound) following straightforwardly from Corollary 3.

**Example 4.** *Every 4-vertex 3-uniform hypergraph not containing  $K_4^{(3)}$  has at most three edges, i.e.  $\overline{\text{ex}}(4; K_4^{(3)}) = 3/4$ . Consequently, we also have  $\overline{\text{ex}}(4; K_4^{(3)}) \leq 3/4$ , and thus  $\text{ex}(5; K_4^{(3)}) \leq \frac{3}{4} \binom{5}{3} = 7.5$ . Since  $\text{ex}(5; K_4^{(3)})$  is an integer, we have  $\text{ex}(5; K_4^{(3)}) \leq 7$ , and thus  $\overline{\text{ex}}(5; K_4^{(3)}) \leq 7/10$ . Therefore,  $\text{ex}(n; K_4^{(3)}) \leq \frac{7}{10} \binom{n}{3}$  for every  $n \geq 5$  and  $\overline{\text{ex}}(\infty; K_4^{(3)}) \leq 7/10$ .*

Our goal now is to investigate the extremal function for the Fano hypergraph Fano, whose vertex set is formed by vectors 001, 010,  $\dots$ , 111 and  $\{x, y, z\}$  is a hyperedge iff  $x + y + z = 0$  holds in  $\mathbb{Z}_2^3$  (equivalently, Fano is the hypergraph whose vertices are the points and edges are the lines of the Fano plane, the finite projective plane of order two). A short case analysis shows that for any assignment of colors 1 and 2 to the vertices of Fano, there exists a monochromatic hyperedge. Hence, Fano is not a subgraph of the hypergraph  $B_n^{(3)}$  whose vertex set consists of two parts  $A$  and  $B$  such that  $|A| = \lfloor n/2 \rfloor$  and  $|B| = \lceil n/2 \rceil$  and the edges are all triples intersecting both  $A$  and  $B$ .

**Theorem 5.** *For sufficiently large  $n$ , we have  $\text{ex}(n; \text{Fano}) = \|B_n^{(3)}\|$ , and  $B_n^{(3)}$  is the only  $n$ -vertex 3-uniform hypergraph with this many hyperedges not containing Fano as a subhypergraph.*

To prove Theorem 5, we need a couple of auxiliary results.

**Lemma 6.** *Let  $G$  be a multigraph with  $n \geq 3$  vertices. If any three vertices induce a submultigraph with at most 10 edges, then  $\|G\| \leq 3 \binom{n}{2} + n - 2$ .*

*Proof.* We prove the claim by induction on  $n$ . The claim clearly holds for  $n = 3$ , and thus we can assume  $n \geq 4$ . If all edges have multiplicity at most 3, then  $\|G\| \leq 3 \binom{n}{2}$ . Otherwise, consider vertices  $u$  and  $v$  joined by an edge of multiplicity  $m \geq 4$ . The number of edges between  $\{u, v\}$  and any other vertex is at most 10  $- m$  by the assumptions, and thus the number of edges between  $\{u, v\}$  and the rest of the graph is at most  $(10 - m)(n - 2)$ . Hence,  $\deg u + \deg v \leq (10 - m)(n - 2) + 2m$ , and by symmetry we can assume  $\deg v \leq (10 - m)(n - 2)/2 + m$ . By the induction hypothesis, we

have  $\|G - v\| \leq 3\binom{n-1}{2} + n - 3$ , and thus

$$\begin{aligned} \|G\| &\leq 3\binom{n-1}{2} + n - 3 + (10 - m)(n - 2)/2 + m \\ &\leq 3\binom{n-1}{2} + n + 3(n - 2) + 1 = 3\binom{n}{2} + n - 2. \end{aligned}$$

□

A similar argument gives the following.

**Lemma 7.** *Let  $G$  be a multigraph with  $n \geq 4$  vertices. If any four vertices induce a submultigraph with at most 20 edges, then  $\|G\| \leq 3\binom{n}{2} + (4n - 10)/3$ .*

*Proof.* We prove the claim by induction on  $n$ . The claim clearly holds for  $n = 4$ , and thus we can assume  $n \geq 5$ . If any three vertices induce a submultigraph with at most 10 edges, then the claim follows from Lemma 6. Hence, suppose that the submultigraph induced by  $\{u, v, w\}$  has  $m \geq 11$  edges. The number of edges between  $\{u, v, w\}$  and any other vertex is at most  $20 - m$  by the assumptions, and thus  $\deg u + \deg v + \deg w \leq (20 - m)(n - 3) + 2m$ . By symmetry, we can assume  $\deg v \leq ((20 - m)(n - 3) + 2m)/3$ . By the induction hypothesis, we have  $\|G - v\| \leq 3\binom{n-1}{2} + 4n/3 - 14/3$ , and thus

$$\begin{aligned} \|G\| &\leq 3\binom{n-1}{2} + 4n/3 - 14/3 + ((20 - m)(n - 3) + 2m)/3 \\ &\leq 3\binom{n-1}{2} + 13(n - 23)/3 = 3\binom{n}{2} + (4n - 10)/3. \end{aligned}$$

□

For a 3-uniform hypergraph  $G$  and a set  $S \subseteq V(G)$ , the link multigraph of  $S$  in  $G$  is the multigraph with vertex set  $V(G) \setminus S$ , where each pair  $xy$  of vertices is an edge whose multiplicity is the number of vertices  $z \in S$  such that  $\{x, y, z\}$  is a hyperedge of  $G$ . For  $z \in S$ , let  $L(z)$  denote the set of edges of this link graph such that the corresponding hyperedge contains  $S$ .

**Lemma 8.** *Let  $G$  be a 3-uniform hypergraph and let  $S$  be a set of four vertices such that  $G[S]$  is complete. Let  $L$  be the link multigraph of  $S$  in  $G$ . If some four vertices of  $L$  induce a submultigraph with at least 21 edges, then  $\text{Fano} \subseteq G$ .*

*Proof.* Let  $S = \{v_1, v_2, v_3, v_4\}$ . Suppose  $\|L[\{x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4\}]\| \geq 21$ . For  $i \in \{1, 2, 3\}$ , let  $M_i$  be the perfect matching on  $\{x_1, \dots, x_4\}$  containing the edge  $x_1 x_{i+1}$ . We can assume  $|L(v_1)| \geq \dots \geq |L(v_4)|$ . Since  $21 \leq \|L[\{x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4\}]\| = |L(v_1)| + \dots + |L(v_4)|$ , we have  $|L(v_2)|, |L(v_3)| \geq 5$ , and thus we can by symmetry assume  $M_2 \subseteq L(v_2)$  and  $M_3 \subseteq L(v_3)$ . Moreover, we have  $|L(v_1)| \geq 6$ , and thus  $M_1 \subseteq L(v_1)$ . Then the hyperedges  $\{v_i, x, y\}$  for  $i \in \{1, 2, 3\}$  and  $xy \in M_i$  together with the hyperedge  $\{v_1, v_2, v_3\}$  form Fano.  $\square$

We are now ready to prove the asymptotic form of Theorem 5.

**Theorem 9.**

$$\overline{\text{ex}}(\infty; \text{Fano}) = 3/4.$$

*Proof.* Recall that  $\text{Fano} \not\subseteq B_n^{(3)}$ , and observe that  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\|B_n^{(3)}\|}{\binom{n}{3}} = 3/4$ . Hence,  $\overline{\text{ex}}(\infty; \text{Fano}) \geq 3/4$ .

We now aim to prove that  $\overline{\text{ex}}(\infty; \text{Fano}) \leq 3/4$ . To this end, we need to prove that for every  $\varepsilon > 0$  and sufficiently large  $n$ , if  $G$  is a 3-uniform  $n$ -vertex hypergraph with at least  $(3/4 + \varepsilon)n^3/6$  hyperedges, then  $\text{Fano} \subseteq G$ . First, as long as  $G$  contains a vertex incident with less than  $(3/4 + \varepsilon/2)n^2/2$  hyperedges, keep deleting such vertices. We end up with an  $n_0$ -vertex hypergraph  $G_0$  of minimum degree at least  $(3/4 + \varepsilon/2)n_0^2/2$ , and as usual, it is easy to argue that  $n_0 = \Omega(\varepsilon^{1/3}n)$ .

Since  $\|G_0\| \geq (3/4 + \varepsilon/2)n_0^3/6$ , Example 4 implies that  $K_4^{(3)} \subseteq G_0$ . Let  $S$  be the vertex set of this  $K_4^{(3)}$  and  $L$  the corresponding link multigraph. Since  $G_0$  has minimum degree at least  $(3/4 + \varepsilon/2)n_0^2/2$ , each vertex of  $S$  contributes at least  $(3/4 + \varepsilon/2)n_0^2/2 - 3n_0 \geq (3/4 + \varepsilon/4)\binom{n_0}{2}$ , and thus  $\|L\| \geq (3 + \varepsilon)\binom{n_0}{2}$ . By Lemma 7, this implies there exists a set of four vertices of  $L$  inducing more than 20 edges. By Lemma 8, this implies  $\text{Fano} \subseteq G$ .  $\square$

Next, we need the corresponding stability result, showing that near-extremal graphs are close to  $B_n^{(3)}$ .

**Theorem 10.** *For every  $\varepsilon > 0$ , there exists  $\gamma > 0$  and  $n_0$  such that for every 3-uniform hypergraph  $G$  with  $n \geq n_0$  vertices and at least  $(3/4 - \gamma)n^3/6$  hyperedges, if  $\text{Fano} \not\subseteq G$ , then there exists a partition of  $V(G)$  to parts  $A$  and  $B$  such that  $\|G[A]\| + \|G[B]\| \leq \varepsilon n^3$ .*

The proof of Theorem 10 follows an idea similar to the one of the proof of Theorem 9, but is somewhat more lengthy; if you are interested, see [1, Theorem 1.2]. We now need one more simple claim. Let  $\mu(G)$  denote the maximum size of a matching in a graph  $G$ .

**Lemma 11.** *For every  $n$ -vertex graph  $G$ , we have  $\|G\| \leq 2\mu(G)n$ .*

*Proof.* Let  $M$  be a largest matching in  $G$ . Then every edge is incident with at least one vertex of  $V(M)$  and  $|V(M)| = 2\mu(G)$ .  $\square$

Next, let us prove the weaker variant of Theorem 5 for graphs of bounded minimum degree.

**Lemma 12.** *There exists  $n_0$  such that the following holds. Let  $G$  be a 3-uniform hypergraph with  $n \geq n_0$  vertices and  $\text{ex}(n; \text{Fano})$  hyperedges. If  $\text{Fano} \not\subseteq G$  and  $\delta(G) \geq \delta(B_n^{(3)})$ , then  $\|G\| \leq \|B_n^{(3)}\|$ , with equality iff  $G = B_n^{(3)}$ .*

*Proof.* Choose sufficiently small  $\varepsilon > 0$  and sufficiently large  $n_0$ . Let  $A$  and  $B$  form a partition of  $V(G)$  minimizing  $\|G[A]\| + \|G[B]\|$ ; by Theorem 10, we have  $\|G[A]\| + \|G[B]\| \leq \varepsilon n^3$ . Note that for  $x \in A$ , we have  $\left|L(x) \cap \binom{A}{2}\right| \leq \left|L(x) \cap \binom{B}{2}\right|$ , as otherwise moving  $x$  to  $B$  would decrease the number of hyperedges within the parts. Symmetrically,  $\left|L(y) \cap \binom{B}{2}\right| \leq \left|L(y) \cap \binom{A}{2}\right|$  for every  $y \in B$ .

Let  $q$  denote the number of triples intersecting both  $A$  and  $B$  that are not hyperedges of  $G$ . Let  $\Delta = \|A\| - n/2 = \|B\| - n/2$ . Since  $\delta(G) \geq \delta(B_n^{(3)}) \geq (3/8 - 3\varepsilon)n^2$ , we have

$$\begin{aligned} (1/8 - \varepsilon)n^3 &\leq \|G\| = \binom{|A|}{2}|B| + \binom{|B|}{2}|A| - q + \|G[A]\| + \|G[B]\| \\ &\leq |A||B|n/2 - q + \varepsilon n^3 = (1/8 + \varepsilon)n^3 - \Delta^2 n/2 - q. \end{aligned}$$

Hence, we have  $q \leq 2\varepsilon n^3$  and  $\Delta \leq 2\varepsilon^{1/2}n$ .

Suppose next that there exists  $x \in A$  such that  $\left|L(x) \cap \binom{A}{2}\right| > 4\varepsilon^{1/3}n^2$ , and thus also  $\left|L(x) \cap \binom{B}{2}\right| > 4\varepsilon^{1/3}n^2$ . By Lemma 11, there exist matchings  $M_A \subseteq L(x) \cap \binom{A}{2}$  and  $M_B \subseteq L(x) \cap \binom{B}{2}$  of size at least  $2\varepsilon^{1/3}n$ . If there existed an edge  $a_1a_2 \in M_A$  and distinct edges  $b_1b_2, c_1c_2 \in M_B$  such that  $\{a_i, b_j, c_k\} \in E(G)$  for all  $i, j, k \in \{1, 2\}$ , then we would have  $\text{Fano} \subseteq G$ . Hence, this is not the case, and thus for each edge of  $M_A$  and a pair of distinct edges of  $M_B$ , there exists a non-hyperedge of  $G$  intersecting all of them. Consequently,  $q \geq |M_A| \binom{|M_B|}{2} \geq 8\varepsilon n^3/3$ , which is a contradiction.

Therefore, we have  $\left|L(x) \cap \binom{A}{2}\right| \leq 4\varepsilon^{1/3}n^2$  for every  $x \in A$ , and symmetrically,  $\left|L(y) \cap \binom{B}{2}\right| \leq 4\varepsilon^{1/3}n^2$  for every  $y \in B$ . Suppose now that there exists

a hyperedge  $\{x_1, x_2, x_3\} \in E(G[A])$ . For  $i \in \{1, 2, 3\}$ , we have

$$\begin{aligned} \left| L(x_i) \cap \binom{B}{2} \right| &\geq \deg x - \left| L(x) \cap \binom{A}{2} \right| - |A||B| \\ &\geq (3/8 - \varepsilon)n^2 - 4\varepsilon^{1/3}n^2 - n^2/4 + \Delta^2 \\ &\geq (1/8 - 9\varepsilon^{1/3})n^2. \end{aligned}$$

Since  $\binom{|B|}{2} \leq (n/2 + \Delta)^2/2 \leq (1/8 + 2\varepsilon^{1/2})n^2$ ,  $L(x_i)$  has at most  $11\varepsilon^{1/3}n^2$  non-edges in  $\binom{B}{2}$ . Consequently, all but at most  $33\varepsilon^{1/3}n^2$  pairs of vertices in  $\binom{B}{2}$  are joined by a triple edge in  $(L(x_1) \cup L(x_2) \cup L(x_3)) \cap \binom{B}{2}$ . By Turán's theorem, there exist four vertices  $y_1, \dots, y_4 \in B$  such that any pair of them is joined by a triple edge in  $L(x_1) \cup L(x_2) \cup L(x_3)$ . However, this implies  $\text{Fano} \subseteq G$ , which is a contradiction.

Therefore,  $E(G[A]) = \emptyset$ , and by symmetry,  $E(G[B]) = \emptyset$ . It follows that  $\|G\| \leq \|B_n^{(3)}\|$ , with equality only if  $G = B_n^{(3)}$ .  $\square$

We are now ready to finish the argument.

*Proof of Theorem 5.* Let  $n_1 = 8n_0^3$ , where  $n_0$  is the constant from Lemma 12. For a 3-uniform hypergraph  $H$ , let  $m(H) = \|H\| - \|B_{|H|}^{(3)}\|$ . Let  $G$  be a 3-uniform hypergraph with  $n \geq n_1$  vertices and  $\text{ex}(n; \text{Fano})$  hyperedges such that  $\text{Fano} \not\subseteq G$ . Since  $\text{Fano} \not\subseteq B_n^{(3)}$ , we have  $m(G) \geq 0$ .

Let  $G_0 = G$ . For  $i \geq 0$ , as long as  $G_i$  contains a vertex  $v$  of degree less than  $\delta(B_{|G_i|}^{(3)})$ , we let  $G_{i+1} = G_i - v$ . Note that  $B_{|G_{i+1}|}^{(3)}$  is obtained from  $B_{|G_i|}^{(3)}$  by deleting a vertex of minimum degree, and thus  $m(G_{i+1}) \geq m(G_i) + 1$ . Let  $G_k$  be the last member of this sequence; we have  $m(G_k) \geq k$ . On the other hand,  $m(G_k) \leq \|G_k\| \leq (n - k)^3$ , and thus  $k + k^{1/3} \leq n$  and  $k \leq n - n^{1/3}/2$ . Consequently,  $|G_k| = n - k \geq n^{1/3}/2 \geq n_0$ .

By the choice of  $G_k$ , we have  $\delta(G_k) \geq \delta(B_{|G_k|}^{(3)})$ , and thus Lemma 12 implies  $m(G_k) = 0$  (and thus  $k = 0$  and  $G_k = G$ ) and  $G_k = B_n^{(3)}$ .  $\square$

## References

- [1] Peter Keevash, Benny Sudakov: *The Turán number of the Fano plane*, *Combinatorica* **25** (2005), 561–574.